Received: 4 July 2020

Revised: 3 January 2021

(wileyonlinelibrary.com) DOI 10.1002/jsfa.11077

### Quality differentiation of cocoa beans: implications for geographical indications

### Carlos Eduardo Hernandez<sup>a\*</sup> <sup>o</sup> and Leonardo Granados<sup>b</sup>

#### Abstract

Geographical indications may stimulate collective actions of governance for quality control, trade and marketing as well as innovation based on the use of local resources and regional biodiversity. Cocoa production, however, dominated by small family agriculture in tropical regions, has rarely made use of such strategies. This review is aimed at understanding major research interests and emerging technologies helpful for the origin differentiation of cocoa quality. Results from literature search and cited references of publications on cocoa research were imported into VOSviewer for data analysis, which aided in visualizing major research hotpots. Co-occurrence analysis yielded major research clusters which guided the discussion of this review. Observed was a consensus recognizing cocoa quality resulting from the interaction of genotype, fermentation variables and geographical origin. A classic view of cocoa genetics based on the dichotomy of 'fine versus bulk' has been reexamined by a broader perspective of human selection and cocoa genotype evolution. This new approach to cocoa genetic diversity, together with the understanding of complex microbiome interactions through fermentation, as well as quality reproducibility challenged by geographical conditions, have demonstrated the importance of *terroir* in the production of special attributes. Cocoa growing communities around the tropics have been clearly enabled by new omics and chemometrics to systematize producing conditions and practices in the designation of specifications for the differentiation of origin quality.

Keywords: cocoa research; cocoa quality; geographical indications; territorial strategies; fermentation

#### INTRODUCTION

Geographical indications (GIs) of food and agricultural products claim a linkage between special quality attributes to *terroir* through a unique combination of conditions at a delimited territorial origin.<sup>1</sup> The recognition of such distinctiveness and reputation is protected by GI labels, which are regulated and implemented by a diversity of mechanisms under different legal frameworks and indication schemes.<sup>2,3</sup> Notably, GIs may play a dynamic role for the protection of cultural heritage, artisanal production and product identity as an evolving ecological system while promoting social learning in food quality governance and adaptation.<sup>4,5</sup>

In general, GIs have been recognized as effective differentiation tools, with discrimination favoring expensive products, and relevance conditioned by country-specific factors (such as culture and reputation).<sup>6</sup> However, registered geographical labels for cocoa beans are uncommon, which in part has been caused by the association between quality of chocolate and geography predominantly linked to locations of manufacturing and final transformations, rather than to cocoa beans as ingredients.<sup>7,8</sup> Nevertheless, a few studies have shown a strong influence on consumer perception of quality for chocolates made from origin-labeled cocoa,<sup>7,9</sup> while abundant chemometric research continues to elucidate the contributions of geography to cocoa quality diversity.<sup>10–12</sup>

Although several studies on cocoa quality provide the scientific background associating *sui generis* conditions with quality responses, recent works also challenge the weight of geographical variables. For instance, much research has focused attention on developing one-pot fermentation solutions for achieving consistent sensory profiles over traditional spontaneous processing.<sup>13,14</sup> Such research progress on postharvest technology has also enabled innovative perspectives less restricted by presumed relationships between cocoa varieties and quality.<sup>15</sup>

As agricultural and postharvest variables have been a matter of research regarding the effects on cocoa and chocolate quality,<sup>16</sup> farming systems around the tropics experience an increased demand for higher quality and productivity, together with an essential need to implement governance structures for guaranteeing sustainability.<sup>17</sup> In this context, GI strategies might represent an effective response to such complex challenges; however, efforts on their development require the understanding of research advances that may offer opportunities towards the determination of essential and relevant attributes bound to geographical origin.

- \* Correspondence to: CE Hernandez, Laboratory of Food Quality Innovation, School of Agricultural Sciences, National University (UNA), 3000 Heredia, Costa Rica. E-mail: cherna@una.cr
- a Laboratory of Food Quality Innovation, School of Agricultural Sciences, National University (UNA), Heredia, Costa Rica
- b Center for the Development of Denominations of Origin and Agrifood Quality (CADENAGRO), School of Agricultural Sciences, National University (UNA), Heredia, Costa Rica

Thus, this review aims to analyze major research trends and discuss their implications for quality differentiation strategies. The article provides important insights into how current research progress enables the development of technical studies, which ultimately is a key step in the formulation of GI specifications. The study was based primarily on very recent literature, published during the last 2 years, whereas the methodological approach integrated previous publications (highly cited articles) to validate strategic research agendas.

#### EMERGING RESEARCH WITH FOCUS ON INTRINSIC QUALITIES OF COCOA BEANS

We reviewed recent publications on cocoa beans to identify hotspots based on bibliographical data, retrieved from Web of Science, searching 'cacao' or 'cocoa' in tittles (journal articles and reviews). Full records and cited references of publications from 2018 to 2020 were imported into VOSviewer 1.6.15 (Leiden University, Leiden, Netherlands) for data analysis (co-occurrence) and visualization. This approach was used to construct keyword maps and to visualize the existing connections among publications, hence facilitating the analysis of abundant literature in a diversity of disciplines. Publications were grouped into five clusters of research, represented by different colors in Fig. 1, with descending order corresponding to the volume of publications. Cluster 1, represented by red, is observed as a highly dense zone with keywords from studies on chemometrics, fingerprinting and chemical profiles. Cluster 2, in green, included topics such as agriculture, agroforestry and climate change. Cluster 3 (blue) was associated with cocoa consumption and health effects. Cluster 4 (yellow) was associated with *Theobroma cacao* genetics, genome evolution and breeding strategies. Lastly, cluster 5 (purple) was linked to fermentation, microbiota studies, metagenomics and metabolomics.

The analysis demonstrated a major emphasis, with greater volume of publications (cluster 1), on the study of the intrinsic attributes of cocoa quality, which included amounts of organic acids, simple sugars, proteins, peptides, free amino acids, lipids, phenolic compounds and methylxanthines, or volatiles linked to aroma and flavor. Furthermore, a closer look into those publications revealed that current attention aims at analyzing origin effects and processing technology tackling the reproducibility of quality.<sup>16,18</sup>

Other research clusters, although relatively less numerical, are shown as current themes of attention driven by urgent social pressures, such as climate change, biodiversity management and sustainability (cluster 2); or consumption and effects on major



occurrence of all keywords (minimum number of occurrences set at five). Visualization by fractionalization with minimum clustering size of 5 and resolution of 1. Network visualization with five clusters represented by different colors.

issues of human health such as emotions and cardiovascular conditions (cluster 3). Clusters 4 and 5 highlighted relevant areas of research during the last 2 years, sustained by the advances of the new omics for the understanding and improvement of the biological aspects of cocoa production (*Theobroma cacao* and fermentative microbiome).

To further contextualize our discussion on cocoa research trends and the implications for territorial differentiations, bibliographical data were also subjected to analysis for top author cluster identification (Fig. 2). This analysis included co-citation referring to most cited authors with a minimum of 20 citations in the last 2 years. Major themes were labeled to illustrate the location of these highly cited authors in their respective research domain. Results pointed out authors that have had a great impact on current research and continue to generate relevant discussions.

This bibliographical analysis guided a comprehensive overview in diverse fields, which revealed major research axes. First, a major focus was observed regarding techniques to study and enhancing aroma, and the use of chemometrics and fingerprinting for the traceability and optimization of quality, with most studies predominantly based on bulk cocoa.<sup>19–22</sup> Second, attention was observed in themes such as productivity and sustainability for the enhancement of the livelihood of farmers while promoting climate resilience.<sup>23–25</sup> Third, the consumption of cocoa and its impact on human health was observed as a major research driver, with studies on the identification and validation of bioactivity, with conclusive benefits for cardiovascular health, insulin signaling and intestinal and mental health.<sup>26–30</sup> Fourth

were genetic studies on genotyping and variance for subsequent breeding strategies, with a major emphasis on disease resistance.<sup>31-36</sup>

The development of new omics boosted a momentum for fermentation research with new emerging approaches, varying from strain interaction (through metagenomics), technical and cultural practices for microbial ecology towards specific volatile responses (again, with special attention on the use of bulk cocoa), to the traceability of functional compounds originated during fermentation.<sup>37–39</sup> Regarding postharvest practices, publications showed an agreement that good processing standards have a greater significance than cocoa varietal factors. However, even for the same microbial species or within delimited producing regions, significant quality differences were observed, which pointed out the importance of both postharvest standards and geographical origin.<sup>40</sup>

# COCOA GENOTYPES AND QUALITY PARADIGMS

Cocoa cultivars have been traditionally associated with generalized quality profiles, denoted by the dichotomy: bulk *versus* fine cocoa. From this perspective, cocoa has been for decades roughly grouped into three types with a range of hybrids in between. Two major ancestral groups have been classically recognized, with Criollos described as highly aromatic and fine cocoa (floral and smoother flavor), while Forasteros identified as rather vigorous with better yields and tolerance to diseases, but with less attractive sensory qualities (strong basic notes).<sup>41</sup> Trinitario cocoa, then,



Figure 2. Analysis of top authors on cocoa research from 2018 to 2020. Analysis based on co-citation of authors by fractional counting, with a minimum of 20 citations per author from 2018 to 2020. Visualization by fractionalization (attraction 10; repulsion 0), with clustering minimum size of 10.

J Sci Food Agric 2021

has been defined as a complex hybrid with characteristics originating from the two major ancestral lines.<sup>42</sup>

The classical view on cocoa diversity, however, has been redefined by a key study which, through genotyping with molecular markers and geographical clustering, characterized 10 genetically differentiated groups, namely: Criollo, Amelonado, Contamana, Curaray, Guianna, Iquitos, Marañon, Nacional, Nanay and Purús.<sup>43</sup> Further works have focused attention on cocoa genomic evolution and population dynamics pointing out a predominant selection for anthocyanins, theobromine and disease resistance, resulting in a majority of resilient populations.<sup>44,45</sup> In contrast, studies on the Criollo domestication process have shown the cost of improvement and selection of desirable traits leading to the accumulation of deleterious mutations.<sup>46</sup>

Notably, the cocoa genomic evolution reflects centuries of human and environmental selection associated with delimited geographical regions, adding to the importance of ancestry and cultural activity in its complex interaction with ecological factors for the construction of quality diversity. A recent review described the chronology of the societal issues and human decision processes influencing the genetic evolution of cocoa plantation from pre-Columbian to modern times.<sup>47</sup>

Modern cocoa breeding programs currently assisted by new molecular technology, undoubtedly, continue to accelerate the progress for achieving improved quality and productivity.<sup>48,49</sup> Nevertheless, remaining poorly understood is the impact of improved varieties on the *in situ* preservation of territorial diversity and quality, considering that breeding programs are constrained by conventional agricultural policies, technical criteria (increased yield, resistance and manageability) and strategies (tree selection through vegetative propagation and production of sexual families by open and controlled pollination).<sup>50</sup> Moreover, the impacts of traditional propagation of cacao by seeds from open pollination remain to be studied further, as these common practices may result in complex genetic structures and segregation of quality attributes.<sup>51</sup>

Extensive research has emphasized the importance of genotype contribution to quality, with a common example being the discrimination of bulk cocoa, such as CCN 51 (bitter, astringent and off-flavor attributes), from fine types, such as Nacional (fruity and acid).<sup>35,52</sup> Whereas other works, centered on the recognition of a complex genetic diversity in a territory, have pointed out major contributions from geography on the generation of distinctive aroma and flavor profiles.<sup>53</sup>

A review on the complex contribution of cocoa genotypes to quality variations, underpinned by geography, has highlighted the effects on contents of bean storage proteins, polysaccharides and polyphenols.<sup>54</sup> Other studies have also found variable concentration of compounds such as pyrazines (earthy), as well as linalool (citrus) among other terpenes, 2- and 3-methylbutanal (malty), methylpropanal (green, pungent) and phenylacetalde-hyde associated with honey, green, floral. Organic acids such as citric acid are traceable compounds with impact on sensory descriptors recognized as differentiating volatiles for fine cocoa and origin,<sup>55</sup> while the origin traceability and fingerprinting of polyphenols<sup>56</sup> and minerals<sup>57</sup> have also been well studied. Additionally, the content of theobromine, caffeine and flavan-3-ols was found to differentiate samples of Nacional cocoa from different region in the same country.<sup>58</sup>

Moreover, challenging the conventional dichotomy of quality, bulk (Forastero type) *versus* fine cocoa (Criollo type), a major cluster of authors has emphasized the importance of postharvest parameters (pod storage, fermentation and roasting) over just cocoa genetics. These authors demonstrated the possibility of creating diverse flavor profiles, resembling fine cocoa, using bulk cocoa varieties, relying on optimized combination of postharvest conditions.<sup>20,59,60</sup>

#### FERMENTATION, MICROBIOTA DYNAMICS AND LOCAL CONDITIONS OF QUALITY

Cocoa bean fermentation is an essential postharvest stage taking 3–7 days, initiated by yeasts and lactic acid bacteria metabolizing carbohydrates and pectin from the pulp, succeeded by acetic acid bacteria, and gradually ending through the drying phase.<sup>14,61,62</sup> This process is directed at stimulating the formation of aroma precursors while minimizing bitterness and astringency.<sup>54,55,63</sup> Varying degrees and heterogenicity are determined by traditional methods applied in different countries,<sup>64</sup> including the use of banana leaves to cover the fermenting mass or specific types of fermenters such as heaps, baskets, wooden boxes, trays and platforms.<sup>15</sup>

The prevailing consensus regarding cocoa distinctive aromas and flavors (before roasting, conching and other processing stages) is that they primarily originate from the interaction of cocoa genotypes and fermentation. For instance, studies on metabolic dynamics have distinguished the formation of some volatiles as pulp-derived (linalool,  $\beta$ -myrcene, 2-heptyl acetate) or intrinsic to the bean (2-heptanol, 2-heptanone, 2-pentanol), while others are generated during fermentation by microbial synthesis (higher alcohols, aldehydes, ketones, organic acids, sugar alcohols (lactic acid bacteria and yeasts) and esters (yeasts)).<sup>14,40,63</sup> Additionally, the effects of cocoa genotypes and fermentation systems on microbial activity have been linked to the diffusion of internal epicatechin and theobromine from the bean cotyledons into the pulp<sup>65</sup>; however, more research is needed to analyze the influence of such diffusions on microbiota diversity and successions.

The interaction of cocoa origin and fermentation has been also explained through a diversity of Amadori compounds, which have been suggested as important quality markers.<sup>66</sup> Moreover, amino acids and peptides have been highlighted as genetic-origin derived, but also mostly related with particular fermentation methods applied in specific geographical origins.<sup>67</sup> Particularly, oligopeptides derived from the vicilin-class (7S) globulin of cocoa beans have been recognized as essential for the formation of the cocoa-specific flavor.<sup>68</sup>

Major progress towards the understanding of quality modulation has been facilitated by studies focused on microbiological diversity in cocoa fermentations from different origins. It has been confirmed that postharvest practices of cocoa overrule the impact of varieties, although significant microbial differences can be observed for different regions within the same country.<sup>40</sup> Microorganism succession, interactions and dominating strains, themselves determined by fermentation techniques and inoculum (either controlled or naturally present), impart strong effects on the volatile and metabolite composition of final products. Hence, the selection of microbial consortia for controlled fermentations with starter cultures has demonstrated the role of yeast and bacteria for the replication of quality.<sup>14,15,64,69-71</sup> For instance, key aroma markers, in particular higher alcohols, phenylethyl alcohol and corresponding esters, have been associated with S. cerevisiae, H. opuntiae, P. kudriavzevii, L. plantarum, A. pasteurianus, K. marxianus, C. inconspicua and L. fermentum.

While off-notes have been related to over-fermentation and the presence of *Bacillus* spp.<sup>40,72</sup>

Cocoa microbial communities and resulting cocoa volatiles are highly conditioned by fermentation technique, with pod storage,<sup>20</sup> turning frequency<sup>73</sup> and fermenter type playing key roles in the formation of predominant volatiles. For example, it has been demonstrated that cocoa beans fermented in boxes show increased concentrations of alcohols and esters compared to heap fermentations, given a faster carbohydrate metabolism and greater production of organic acids. Authors have also suggested necessary minimal or no storage of pods prior to fermentation for preserving fruity, floral and spicy flavor notes, as well as prolonged storage for enhancing volatiles exhibiting more cocoa, chocolate, nutty and roasted flavor notes.74,75 Little has been published, however, on the specific effects of diverse woods used in the construction of fermenters, whereas biochemical exchanges between the wood and the fermentation mass has been well studied in other food bioprocesses.<sup>76</sup>

While spontaneous fermentations have been the traditional norm in most countries, the controlled fermentation relying on the inoculation of selected microorganisms remains a major field of research.<sup>15</sup> Nevertheless, discrepancies are expected when using such starter cultures as cocoa fermentation practices change depending on the geographic origin. Therefore, it is the consensus that cultural factors influencing fermentation techniques, agricultural practices, microenvironmental factors as well as cocoa genotype, and the composition of the microbiological inoculum, determine the complex metabolite dynamics during fermentation, which finally results in specific differentiated aroma and flavor profiles.<sup>40,64,71</sup> Thus, this diversity of conditions and cultural factors influencing fermentation have shown a clear clustering by farm, highlighting the importance of farm protocols for generating unique fingerprinting based on microbiome dynamics.<sup>64</sup> From this perspective a key cluster of research ('de Vyust-Papalexandratou et al.') has consistently demonstrated the essentiality of good fermentation practices, working on the direction of optimized starter cultures, yet recognizing the influence of local factors and techniques on differentiated and optimized sensory profiles.14,40,61

As the chocolate industry is increasing the demand for high outputs of differentiated products exhibiting unique flavors, researchers have dedicated efforts to the development of technology for varietizing bulk cocoa, by enhancing the aroma and inducing distinguishing attributes in otherwise generic products.<sup>14,20</sup> Some recent works have even considered the design of remote fermentation practices, away from on-farm sites, pursuing geography-independent technologies.<sup>21</sup> Thus, evidently, the development of controlled fermentation technology may represent a challenge to origin cocoa, as the optimization of starter cultures and fermentation systems aims at varietizing bulk cocoa beans regardless of the location. However, the use of starter cultures not only has been approached for the modulation of microbial communities, or the production of improved sensory profiles, but also optimizing fermentation time while minimizing quality defects.77

The development of robust methodologies for metabolomic and microbiome studies can facilitate the recognition of local contributing factors for community- or regional-based strategies, towards the origin differentiation of fine cocoa. As an example, high-throughput sequencing of molecular markers for bacteria and yeasts has been used for clustering by farm or region, identifying the effects of farm protocols, climate and bean mass exposure on the dynamics and composition of microbial communities.<sup>64</sup> Additionally, the isolation and use of dominant microbial species from spontaneous fine cocoa fermentation have been recommended as inoculum for differentiated qualities, adapted for specific farm/region and good processing practices.<sup>78</sup>

Thus, territorial strategies could consider the selection of starter cultures based on local biodiversity for a systematic optimization of differentiated qualities, as well as in consideration of local processing practices, genotypes and market demands. Also, studies for the recognition of local microbiota could be essential in the design of protection strategies and the development of designation specifications for origin cocoa.

## NUTRACEUTICAL PROPERTIES AND HUMAN HEALTH

A recent systematic review has concluded that cocoa consumption plays an important role in the human metabolic pathway through reducing oxidative stress, which is widely known to play a key role in in pathogenesis of chronic diseases such as diabetes, cancer and cardiovascular disease.<sup>79</sup> Other recent studies have observed the effects of cocoa on the intestinal microbiota composition, which in turn have been linked to an improved glucose homeostasis and gut health.<sup>80–82</sup> Most publications linked those cocoa benefits to phenolic acids, and particularly flavanol composition, compounds that have been found to be dependent on cocoa origin.<sup>83</sup> But also, some works have associated bioactive properties with oligopeptides from artisanal fermented cocoa.<sup>84</sup>

A major cluster of authors has extensively investigated the effects of cocoa bioactive compounds on human health.<sup>85–87</sup> Further studies had confirmed the role of bound phenolic acids and high-molecular-weight melanoidin.<sup>88–90</sup> This research group has also suggested the differential antioxidant properties and composition of Criollo over Forastero and Trinitario. The authors have pointed out the influence of additional factors such as climate, agricultural systems, postharvest practices and storage conditions on the resulting bioactive properties.

In addition, recent reviews have studied the effects of cocoa consumption on human mood and cognition. Once again, the authors suggested the importance of geographical origin and processing conditions, which had significant impacts on phytochemical composition and consequently on bioactivity. These works described the complex relationship between cocoa consumption and psychopharmacological actions; however, a possible synergistic interaction has been highlighted with contributions from specific bioactive compounds such as flavanols and salsolinol, as well as from orosensory properties.<sup>91,92</sup>

Clearly, the interaction of genotype, fermentation and origin remains fundamental in the determination of bioactive properties of cocoa. Optimized fermentation, for example, has been used for enhancing the antioxidant capacity of cocoa, as some yeasts are actively involved in releasing bound phenolic compounds resulting in higher free phenolic contents.<sup>93</sup> These authors have specifically shown the enhancing capacity attributed to yeast cultures based on *H. thailandica* and *P. kudriavzevii*. Moreover, a review on functional volatiles from inoculated fermentations has shown potential health effects, with important evidence revealing anticarcinogenic and antinociceptive activity of limonene, antitumor activity of benzaldehyde and antioxidant activity of volatiles to stimulate human mood and emotions.<sup>71</sup>

Finally, cocoa consumption has also been studied regarding safety risks with most recent works concerning cadmium concentrations. These investigations observed the influence of postharvest practices, soil geography as well as genotype on the presence of heavy metals in cocoa beans.<sup>56,94–96</sup> Most importantly, research has aimed at developing cultural and processing practices for mitigating and reducing cadmium concentrations, thus laying out strategies for minimizing health risks.<sup>94</sup>

### AUTHENTICATION AND GEOGRAPHICAL DIFFERENTIATION OF QUALITY

As cocoa genotype evolution, together with hybridization practices and breeding programs, results in special population dynamics,<sup>43,46</sup> molecular methods have been developed in the recognition of the resulting genetic diversity in cocoa producing-regions. In particular, molecular marker-based protocols and the use of single nucleotide polymorphism have been well developed for cocoa genotyping.<sup>36,53,97-99</sup> This methodology has been effective in the determination of provenance and geographical delimitation.

However, quality control techniques continue to aim towards more efficient and appropriate methodologies for the traceability of cocoa signatures. Chemometric methods have been implemented for characterizing key compositional markers such as volatiles,<sup>12,100–103</sup> fatty acids,<sup>104</sup> peptides,<sup>11,67,105</sup> bioactive compounds<sup>82,106,107</sup> and methylxanthines,<sup>58,60</sup> as well as heavy metals<sup>56,108–111</sup> and other contaminants.<sup>112,113</sup> From this perspective, a recent review on the traceability of cocoa origin has summarized and discussed destructive and nondestructive technologies providing examples aiming at assessing cocoa quality, the study of new functional properties, the detection of trace contaminants and the detection of authenticity.<sup>10</sup>

Noteworthy, near-infrared spectroscopy has been extensively applied for the rapid nondestructive authentication and geographical classification of cocoa beans.<sup>114–117</sup> Recently, a combined near-infrared hyperspectral imaging and chemometric method has been developed for the discrimination of cocoa hybrids.<sup>118</sup> However, gas chromatography and mass spectrometry (particularly headspace solid-phase microextraction/gas chromatography-mass spectrometry) continue to be used for identifying cocoa based on aroma fingerprints in the interaction with geography.<sup>12,19</sup>

Regardless of the instrumental approach, multivariate analysis has been essential for obtaining relevant and reliable results. Principal component analysis, one of the most common statistical approaches for the analysis of compositional data, has been particularly useful by enabling better visualization of variance and discrimination patterns.<sup>12,19,66,119,120</sup> Other approaches have included hierarchical cluster analysis,<sup>20</sup> and principal component analysis with partial least squares discrimination.

#### TERRITORIAL STRATEGIES FOR DIFFERENTIATION OF COCOA QUALITY

The literature has extensively demonstrated the influence of geographical, cultural and ecological factors on cocoa quality (Fig. 3). However, an effective GI strategy must correspond with the interests of concerned institutional actors and territorial stakeholders, as well as responding to market relevance.<sup>3,4,9</sup> Additionally, the use of appropriate strategies depends on each country's legal framework for the recognition and protection of GIs. A review



**Figure 3.** Diagram representing the multidimensional nature of cocoa quality influenced by cocoa genotypes, microbiota dynamics and postharvest and agricultural practices. These interactions are underpinned by ecological, environmental, historical, cultural and social dimensions associated with the territory.

has discussed the concept of *terroir* of agricultural products emphasizing the importance of metabolites as a response to cultural and environmental factors, as well as justifying the significance of agronomic and postharvest practices, all of which have been extensively studied in regards to cocoa quality.<sup>1</sup>

Protected designations of origin and protected Gls, for instance, have been considered effective and dynamic, being adaptable to relevant social demands or market forces. Thus, evolving socioeconomic conditions and changes in the biophysical environment can also trigger amendments to product specifications in the consideration of new demands.<sup>5</sup> Correspondingly, recent research on cocoa has responded to current issues of relevance from social and market standpoints, which in turn provides a base for the development of community-based strategies towards the innovation and differentiation of quality.

As seen throughout this review, several quality-determining factors are closely bound by complex interactions and are highly relevant in the definition of these strategies. Therefore, communitybased strategies must promote the participation of key territorial actors for the designation of specifications from a multidisciplinary perspective. Hence, it is necessary to develop the description of genotypes, harvesting and postharvesting protocols, fermentation technology for the modulation of desirable flavor and aroma profiles, compositional analysis of key compounds as origin markers, as well as agricultural conditions and practices. Moreover, it is fundamental to incorporate the consideration of historical, environmental and cultural aspects for sustainability in response to institutional, social and market demands.

#### CONCLUSIONS

This review has presented recent progress on technical advancements regarding quality differentiation of cocoa beans. Network analysis provided an in-depth comprehension of major research clusters focused on the study of intrinsic cues. The consensus is that quality can be extensively differentiated by the interaction of cocoa genetics and fermentation microbiome, underpinned by geographical factors (territorial, environmental, cultural and social factors).

Thus, human pressure throughout the historical production of cocoa has generated origin quality mirrored in the selection of genotypes and fermentation practices (systems and preferred microbiome successions), which associated with ecological, cultural and market-oriented aspects have yielded a diversity of distinguishable cocoa bean profiles.

The increased demand for varietal and origin cocoa has created challenges and opportunities for farming communities around the tropics, to encourage the systematic control of production and processing practices. Moreover, the advances in omics and chemometrics for the analysis of key markers of quality can facilitate efforts towards the development of preliminary studies, and the designation of specifications.

Efforts towards the promotion of GIs must rely on the coordination of actions with success and evolution being closely related to effective governance. Furthermore, GIs may promote communitybased dynamics for prestige construction and protection while fostering innovation. Overall, the implementation of GI strategies can stimulate a collective approach to quality control and trade, as well as may encourage processes for territorial innovation based on the use of local biodiversity, cultural and institutional resources.

Cocoa quality diversity could be boosted by further research aimed at better understanding the traditional production of cocoa, with special attention on key microorganism dynamics influenced by specific cocoa-genotype factors (pulp characteristics and biochemical diffusion into the pulp), and vice versa the effect of recognized microbial ecosystems on specific cocoa genotypes. Also, more studies are needed on the contribution of local bioresources such as the types of wood used in fermenters, aeration practices and the ecology of dominant and volatile active microorganisms.

#### REFERENCES

- 1 Lucini L, Rocchetti G and Trevisan M, Extending the concept of terroir from grapes to other agricultural commodities: an overview. *Curr Opin Food Sci* **31**:88–95 (2020).
- 2 Tashiro A, Uchiyama Y and Kohsaka R, Impact of geographical indication schemes on traditional knowledge in changing agricultural landscapes: an empirical analysis from Japan. J Rural Stud 68: 46–53 (2019).
- 3 Rizo MP, Frigant N and Ghetu V, *Geographical Indications*. World Intellectual Property Organization, Geneva (2017).
- 4 Edelmann H, Quiñones-Ruiz XF, Penker M, Scaramuzzi S, Broscha K, Jeanneaux P *et al.*, Social learning in food quality governance – evidences from geographical indications amendments. *Int J Commons* 14:108–122 (2020).
- 5 Marescotti A, Quiñones-Ruiz XF, Edelmann H, Belletti G, Broscha K, Altenbuchner C et al., Are protected geographical indications evolving due to environmentally related justifications? An analysis of amendments in the fruit and vegetable sector in the European Union. Sustainability 12:3571 (2020).
- 6 Santeramo FG and Lamonaca E, Evaluation of geographical label in consumers' decision-making process: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Food Res Int* **131**:108–995 (2020).
- 7 Otter V, Prechtel B and Theuvsen L, Country of origin effect for food products from developing and transition countries: a PLS analysis of German consumers' perception. *J Int Food Agribus Mark* **30**: 355–381 (2018).

- 8 Cidell JL and Alberts HC, Constructing quality: the multinational histories of chocolate. *Geoforum* **37**:999–1007 (2006).
- 9 Otter V, Prechtel B and Theuvsen L, The country of origin effect for chocolate made from Ecuadorian cocoa: an empirical analysis of consumer perceptions. *Econ Agro-Alimentare* **16**:43–60 (2014).
- 10 Quelal-Vásconez MA, Lerma-García MJ, Pérez-Esteve É, Talens P and Barat JM, Roadmap of cocoa quality and authenticity control in the industry: a review of conventional and alternative methods. *Compr Rev Food Sci Food Saf* **19**:448–478 (2020).
- 11 Caligiani A, Marseglia A, Prandi B, Palla G and Sforza S, Influence of fermentation level and geographical origin on cocoa bean oligopeptide pattern. *Food Chem* **211**:431–439 (2016).
- 12 Marseglia A, Musci M, Rinaldi M, Palla G and Caligiani A, Volatile fingerprint of unroasted and roasted cocoa beans (*Theobroma cacao* L.) from different geographical origins. *Food Res Int* **132**:109101 (2020).
- 13 Chagas Junior GCA, Ferreira NR and Lopes AS, The microbiota diversity identified during the cocoa fermentation and the benefits of the starter cultures use: an overview. *Int J Food Sci Technol*:14740 (2020).
- 14 De Vuyst L and Leroy F, Functional role of yeasts, lactic acid bacteria and acetic acid bacteria in cocoa fermentation processes. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* **44**:432–453 (2020).
- 15 Figueroa-Hernández C, Mota-Gutierrez J, Ferrocino I, Hernández-Estrada ZJ, González-Ríos O, Cocolin L *et al.*, The challenges and perspectives of the selection of starter cultures for fermented cocoa beans. *Int J Food Microbiol* **301**:41–50 (2019).
- 16 Toker OS, Palabiyik I, Pirouzian HR, Aktar T and Konar N, Chocolate aroma: factors, importance and analysis. *Trends Food Sci Technol* **99**:580–592 (2020).
- 17 Vogel C, Mathé S, Geitzenauer M, Ndah HT, Sieber S, Bonatti M *et al.*, Stakeholders' perceptions on sustainability transition pathways of the cocoa value chain towards improved livelihood of small-scale farming households in Cameroon. *Int J Agric Sustainability* **18**: 55–69 (2020).
- 18 Engeseth NJ and Ac Pangan MF, Current context on chocolate flavor development: a review. *Curr Opin Food Sci* **21**:84–91 (2018).
- 19 Rottiers H, Tzompa Sosa DA, Van de Vyver L, Hinneh M, Everaert H, De Wever J et al., Discrimination of cocoa liquors based on their odor fingerprint: a fast GC electronic nose suitability study. Food Anal Methods 12:475–488 (2019).
- 20 Hinneh M, Abotsi EE, Van de Walle D, Tzompa-Sosa DA, De Winne A, Simonis J *et al.*, Pod storage with roasting: a tool to diversifying the flavor profiles of dark chocolates produced from 'bulk' cocoa beans? (Part II: quality and sensory profiling of chocolates). *Food Res Int* **132**:109116 (2020).
- 21 Schlüter A, Hühn T, Kneubühl M, Chatelain K, Rohn S and Chetschik I, Novel time- and location-independent postharvest treatment of cocoa beans: investigations on the aroma formation during 'moist incubation' of unfermented and dried cocoa nibs and comparison to traditional fermentation. J Agric Food Chem 68:10336–10344 (2020).
- 22 Frauendorfer F and Schieberle P, Key aroma compounds in fermented Forastero cocoa beans and changes induced by roasting. *Eur Food Res Technol* **245**:1907–1915 (2019).
- 23 Nyantakyi-Frimpong H, Matous P and Isaac ME, Smallholder farmers' social networks and resource-conserving agriculture in Ghana: a multicase comparison using exponential random graph models. *Ecol Soc* **24**:art5 (2019).
- 24 Gateau-Rey L, Tanner EVJ, Rapidel B, Marelli J-P and Royaert S, Climate change could threaten cocoa production: effects of 2015-16 El Niñorelated drought on cocoa agroforests in Bahia, Brazil. *PLoS One* **13**: e0200454 (2018).
- 25 Abdulai I, Vaast P, Hoffmann MP, Asare R, Jassogne L, Van Asten P et al., Cocoa agroforestry is less resilient to suboptimal and extreme climate than cocoa in full sun: reply to Norgrove (2017). Global Change Biol **24**:e733–e740 (2018).
- 26 Li J, Wang X, Zhang X, Gao L, Wang L and Yin X, Epicatechin protects against myocardial ischemia-induced cardiac injury via activation of the PTEN/PI3K/AKT pathway. *Mol Med Rep* **17**:8300–8308 (2018).
- 27 Montagnana M, Danese E, Angelino D, Mena P, Rosi A, Benati M et al., Dark chocolate modulates platelet function with a mechanism mediated by flavan-3-ol metabolites. *Medicine* 97:e13432 (2018).
- 28 Martini S, Conte A and Tagliazucchi D, Comprehensive evaluation of phenolic profile in dark chocolate and dark chocolate enriched with

Sakura green tea leaves or turmeric powder. *Food Res Int* **112**:1–16 (2018).

- 29 Suominen MH, Laaksonen MML, Salmenius-Suominen H, Kautiainen H, Hongisto S-M, Tuukkanen K et al., The short-term effect of dark chocolate flavanols on cognition in older adults: a randomized controlled trial (FlaSeCo). Exp Gerontol 136:110933 (2020).
- 30 Matsumoto C, Tomiyama H, Kimura K, Shiina K, Kamei M, Inagaki H et al., Modulation of blood pressure-lowering effects of dark chocolate according to an insulin sensitivity-randomized crossover study. *Hypertens Res* 43:575–578 (2020).
- 31 Bekele FL, Bidaisee GG, Singh H and Saravanakumar D, Morphological characterisation and evaluation of cacao (*Theobroma cacao* L.) in Trinidad to facilitate utilisation of Trinitario cacao globally. *Genet Resour Crop Evol* **67**:621–643 (2020).
- 32 Fister AS, Leandro-Muñoz ME, Zhang D, Marden JH, Tiffin P, DePamphilis C *et al.*, Widely distributed variation in tolerance to *Phytophthora palmivora* in four genetic groups of cacao. *Tree Genet Genomes* **16**:1–9 (2020).
- 33 Pimenta Neto AA, Laranjeira D, Pires JL and Luz EDMN, Selection of cocoa progenies for resistance to witches' broom. *Trop Plant Pathol* 43:381–388 (2018).
- 34 Ricaño-Rodríguez J, Hipólito-Romero E, Ramos-Prado JM and Cocoletzi-Vásquez E, Genotipado por secuenciación de variedades tradicionales de Theobroma cacao (Malvaceae) del Estado de Tabasco, México. *Bot Sci* **97**:381 (2019).
- 35 Scharf A, Lang C and Fischer M, Genetic authentication: differentiation of fine and bulk cocoa (*Theobroma cacao* L.) by a new CRISPR/Cas9-based in vitro method. *Food Control* **114**:107219 (2020).
- 36 De Wever J, Everaert H, Coppieters F, Rottiers H, Dewettinck K, Lefever S *et al.*, The development of a novel SNP genotyping assay to differentiate cacao clones. *Sci Rep* **9**:9512 (2019).
- 37 Almeida OGG, Pinto UM, Matos CB, Frazilio DA, Braga VF, von Zeska-Kress MR et al., Does quorum sensing play a role in microbial shifts along spontaneous fermentation of cocoa beans? An in silico perspective. Food Res Int 131:109034 (2020).
- 38 Serra JL, Moura FG, Pereira GVDM, Soccol CR, Rogez H and Darnet S, Determination of the microbial community in Amazonian cocoa bean fermentation by Illumina-based metagenomic sequencing. *LWT Food Sci Technol* **106**:229–239 (2019).
- 39 Agyirifo DS, Wamalwa M, Otwe EP, Galyuon I, Runo S, Takrama J *et al.*, Metagenomics analysis of cocoa bean fermentation microbiome identifying species diversity and putative functional capabilities. *Heliyon* **5**:e02170 (2019).
- 40 Papalexandratou Z, Kaasik K, Kauffmann LV, Skorstengaard A, Bouillon G, Espensen JL *et al.*, Linking cocoa varietals and microbial diversity of Nicaraguan fine cocoa bean fermentations and their impact on final cocoa quality appreciation. *Int J Food Microbiol* **304**:106–118 (2019).
- 41 Aprotosoaie AC, Luca SV and Miron A, Flavor chemistry of cocoa and cocoa products: an overview. *Compr Rev Food Sci Food Saf* 15:73–91 (2016).
- 42 Yang JY, Scascitelli M, Motilal LA, Sveinsson S, Engels JMM, Kane NC et al., Complex origin of Trinitario-type Theobroma cacao (Malvaceae) from Trinidad and Tobago revealed using plastid genomics. Tree Genet Genomes **9**:829–840 (2013).
- 43 Motamayor JC, Lachenaud P, Silva e Mota JW d, Loor R, Kuhn DN, Brown JS *et al.*, Geographic and genetic population differentiation of the Amazonian chocolate tree (*Theobroma cacao* L). *PLoS One* **3**: e3311 (2008).
- 44 Schwarzkopf EJ, Motamayor JC and Cornejo OE, Genetic differentiation and intrinsic genomic features explain variation in recombination hotspots among cocoa tree populations. *BMC Genomics* 21: 332 (2020).
- 45 Lachenaud P and Motamayor JC, The Criollo cacao tree (Theobroma cacao L.): a review. Genet Resour Crop Evol 64:1807–1820 (2017).
- 46 Cornejo OE, Yee M-C, Dominguez V, Andrews M, Sockell A, Strandberg E *et al.*, Population genomic analyses of the chocolate tree, *Theobroma cacao* L., provide insights into its domestication process. *Commun Biol* **1**:167 (2018).
- 47 Díaz-Valderrama JR, Leiva-Espinoza ST and Aime MC, The history of cacao and its diseases in the Americas. *Phytopathology* **110**: 1604–1619 (2020).
- 48 Osorio-Guarín JA, Berdugo-Cely JA, Coronado-Silva RA, Baez E, Jaimes Y and Yockteng R, Genome-wide association study reveals

novel candidate genes associated with productivity and disease resistance to *Moniliophthora* spp. in cacao (*Theobroma cacao* L.). *G3 Genes Genomes Genetics* **10**:1713–1725 (2020).

- 49 Gutiérrez OA, Campbell AS and Phillips-Mora W, Breeding for disease resistance in cacao, in *Cacao Diseases*. Springer International, Cham, pp. 567–609 (2016).
- 50 DuVal A, Gezan SA, Mustiga G, Stack C, Marelli J-P, Chaparro J *et al.*, Genetic parameters and the impact of off-types for *Theobroma cacao* L. in a breeding program in Brazil. *Front Plant Sci* **8**:1–12. (2017).
- 51 Trognitz B, Cros E, Assemat S, Davrieux F, Forestier-Chiron N, Ayestas E et al., Diversity of cacao trees in Waslala, Nicaragua: associations between genotype spectra, product quality and yield potential. PLoS One 8:e54079 (2013).
- 52 Rottiers H, Tzompa Sosa DA, Lemarcq V, De Winne A, De Wever J, Everaert H *et al.*, A multipronged flavor comparison of Ecuadorian CCN51 and Nacional cocoa cultivars. *Eur Food Res Technol* **245**: 2459–2478 (2019).
- 53 Adenet S, Regina F, Rogers D, Bharath S, Argout X, Rochefort K et al., Study of the genetic diversity of cocoa populations (*Theobroma cacao* L.) of Martinique (FWI) and potential for processing and the cocoa industry. *Genet Resour Crop Evol* 67:1969–1979 (2020).
- 54 Kongor JE, Hinneh M, Van de Walle D, Afoakwa EO, Boeckx P and Dewettinck K, Factors influencing quality variation in cocoa (*Theobroma cacao*) bean flavour profile: a review. *Food Res Int* 82:44–52 (2016).
- 55 Castro-Alayo EMEM, Idrogo-Vásquez G, Siche R and Cardenas-Toro FPFP, Formation of aromatic compounds precursors during fermentation of Criollo and Forastero cocoa. *Heliyon* **5**:e01157 (2019).
- 56 Vanderschueren R, Montalvo D, De Ketelaere B, Delcour JA and Smolders E, The elemental composition of chocolates is related to cacao content and origin: a multi-element fingerprinting analysis of single origin chocolates. *J Food Compos Anal* **83**:103277 (2019).
- 57 Bertoldi D, Barbero A, Camin F, Caligiani A and Larcher R, Multielemental fingerprinting and geographic traceability of *Theobroma cacao* beans and cocoa products. *Food Control* **65**:46–53 (2016).
- 58 Samaniego I, Espín S, Quiroz J, Ortiz B, Carrillo W, García-Viguera C *et al.*, Effect of the growing area on the methylxanthines and flavan-3-ols content in cocoa beans from Ecuador. *J Food Compos Anal* **88**:103448 (2020).
- 59 Hinneh M, Abotsi EE, Van de Walle D, Tzompa-Sosa DA, De Winne A, Simonis J *et al.*, Pod storage with roasting: a tool to diversifying the flavor profiles of dark chocolates produced from 'bulk' cocoa beans? (Part I: aroma profiling of chocolates). *Food Res Int* **119**: 84–98 (2019).
- 60 Tuenter E, Delbaere C, De Winne A, Bijttebier S, Custers D, Foubert K *et al.*, Non-volatile and volatile composition of west African bulk and Ecuadorian fine-flavor cocoa liquor and chocolate. *Food Res Int* **130**:108943 (2020).
- 61 De Vuyst L, Weckx S. the cocoa bean fermentation process: from ecosystem analysis to starter culture development. J Appl Microbiol 121: 5–17 (2016).
- 62 Viesser JA, de Melo Pereira GV, de Carvalho Neto DP, Vandenberghe LPDS, Azevedo V, Brenig B *et al.*, Exploring the contribution of fructophilic lactic acid bacteria to cocoa beans fermentation: isolation, selection and evaluation. *Food Res Int* **136**:109478 (2020).
- 63 Rottiers H, Tzompa Sosa DA, De Winne A, Ruales J, De Clippeleer J, De Leersnyder I *et al.*, Dynamics of volatile compounds and flavor precursors during spontaneous fermentation of fine flavor Trinitario cocoa beans. *Eur Food Res Technol* **245**: 1917–1937 (2019).
- 64 Pacheco-Montealegre ME, Dávila-Mora LL, Botero-Rute LM, Reyes A and Caro-Quintero A, Fine resolution analysis of microbial communities provides insights into the variability of cocoa bean fermentation. *Front Microbiol* **11**:650 (2020).
- 65 Camu N, De Winter T, Addo SK, Takrama JS, Bernaert H and De Vuyst L, Fermentation of cocoa beans: influence of microbial activities and polyphenol concentrations on the flavour of chocolate. *J Sci Food Agric* **88**:2288–2297 (2008).
- 66 Andruszkiewicz PJ, D'souza RN, Corno M and Kuhnert N, Novel Amadori and Heyns compounds derived from short peptides found in dried cocoa beans. *Food Res Int* **133**:109164 (2020).
- 67 Kumari N, Grimbs A, D'souza RN, Verma SK, Corno M, Kuhnert N *et al.*, Origin and varietal based proteomic and peptidomic fingerprinting

00

of *Theobroma cacao* in non-fermented and fermented cocoa beans. *Food Res Int* **111**:137–147 (2018).

- 68 Scalone GLL, Textoris-Taube K, De Meulenaer B, De Kimpe N, Wöstemeyer J and Voigt J, Cocoa-specific flavor components and their peptide precursors. *Food Res Int* **123**:503–515 (2019).
- 69 John WA, Böttcher NLNL, Behrends B, Corno M, D'souza RNN, Kuhnert N *et al.*, Experimentally modelling cocoa bean fermentation reveals key factors and their influences. *Food Chem* **302**:125335 (2020).
- 70 John WA, Böttcher NL, Aßkamp M, Bergounhou A, Kumari N, Ho P-W *et al.*, Forcing fermentation: profiling proteins, peptides and polyphenols in lab-scale cocoa bean fermentation. *Food Chem* **278**: 786–794 (2019).
- 71 Mota-Gutierrez J, Barbosa-Pereira L, Ferrocino I and Cocolin L, Traceability of functional volatile compounds generated on inoculated cocoa fermentation and its potential health benefits. *Nutrients* **11**: 884 (2019).
- 72 Ouattara HG, Elias RJ and Dudley EG, Microbial synergy between *Pichia kudriazevii* YS201 and *Bacillus subtilis* BS38 improves pulp degradation and aroma production in cocoa pulp simulation medium. *Heliyon* **6**:e03269 (2020).
- 73 Hamdouche Y, Meile JC, Lebrun M, Guehi T, Boulanger R, Teyssier C *et al.*, Impact of turning, pod storage and fermentation time on microbial ecology and volatile composition of cocoa beans. *Food Res Int* **119**:477–491 (2019).
- 74 Hinneh M, Van de Walle D, Tzompa-Sosa DA, De Winne A, Termote S, Messens K *et al.*, Tuning the aroma profiles of Forastero cocoa liquors by varying pod storage and bean roasting temperature. *Food Res Int* **125**:108550 (2019).
- 75 Mota-Gutierrez J, Botta C, Ferrocino I, Giordano M, Bertolino M, Dolci P *et al.*, Dynamics and biodiversity of bacterial and yeast communities during fermentation of cocoa beans. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **84**:1–17 (2018).
- 76 Stadler E and Fischer U, Sanitization of oak barrels for wine: a review. *J Agric Food Chem* **68**:5283–5295 (2020).
- 77 Chagas Junior GCA, Ferreira NR, Gloria MBA, Martins LH da S and Lopes AS, Chemical implications and time reduction of on-farm cocoa fermentation by *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* and *Pichia kudriavzevii. Food Chem* **338**:127834 (2021).
- 78 de Lima COC, Vaz ABM, De Castro GM, Lobo F, Solar R, Rodrigues C *et al.*, Integrating microbial metagenomics and physicochemical parameters and a new perspective on starter culture for fine cocoa fermentation. *Food Microbiol* **93**:103608 (2021).
- 79 Mehrabani S, Arab A, Mohammadi H and Amani R, The effect of cocoa consumption on markers of oxidative stress: a systematic review and meta-analysis of interventional studies. *Complement Ther Med* **48**: 102240 (2020).
- 80 Álvarez-Cilleros D, Ramos S, López-Oliva ME, Escrivá F, Álvarez C, Fernández-Millán E *et al.*, Cocoa diet modulates gut microbiota composition and improves intestinal health in Zucker diabetic rats. *Food Res Int* **132**:109058 (2020).
- 81 Álvarez-Cilleros D, López-Oliva E, Goya L, Martín MÁ and Ramos S, Cocoa intake attenuates renal injury in Zucker diabetic fatty rats by improving glucose homeostasis. *Food Chem Toxicol* **127**: 101–109 (2019).
- 82 Sorrenti V, Ali S, Mancin L, Davinelli S, Paoli A and Scapagnini G, Cocoa polyphenols and gut microbiota interplay: bioavailability, prebiotic effect, and impact on human health. *Nutrients* 12:1908 (2020).
- 83 Godočiková L, Ivanišová E, Zaguła G, Noguera-Artiaga L, Carbonell-Barrachina ÁA, Kowalczewski PŁ *et al.*, Antioxidant activities and volatile flavor components of selected single-origin and blend chocolates. *Molecules* **25**:1–13 (2020).
- 84 Domínguez-Pérez LA, Beltrán-Barrientos LM, González-Córdova AF, Hernández-Mendoza A and Vallejo-Cordoba B, Artisanal cocoa bean fermentation: from cocoa bean proteins to bioactive peptides with potential health benefits. *J Funct Foods* **73**:104134 (2020).
- 85 Żyżelewicz D, Budryn G, Oracz J, Antolak H, Kręgiel D and Kaczmarska M, The effect on bioactive components and characteristics of chocolate by functionalization with raw cocoa beans. *Food Res Int* **113**:234–244 (2018).
- 86 Zyzelewicz D, Bojczuk M, Budryn G, Jurgonski A, Zdunczyk Z, Juskiewicz J *et al.*, Influence of diet enriched with cocoa bean extracts on physiological indices of laboratory rats. *Molecules* **24**: 825 (2019).

- 87 Żyżelewicz D, Oracz J, Bojczuk M, Budryn G, Jurgoński A, Juśkiewicz J et al., Effects of raw and roasted cocoa bean extracts supplementation on intestinal enzyme activity, biochemical parameters, and antioxidant status in rats fed a high-fat diet. Nutrients 12:889 (2020).
- 88 Oracz J, Nebesny E and Żyżelewicz D, Identification and quantification of free and bound phenolic compounds contained in the high-molecular weight melanoidin fractions derived from two different types of cocoa beans by UHPLC-DAD-ESI-HR-MSn. *Food Res Int* **115**:135–149 (2019).
- 89 Oracz and Zyzelewicz, In vitro antioxidant activity and FTIR characterization of high-molecular weight melanoidin fractions from different types of cocoa beans. *Antioxidants* **8**:560 (2019).
- 90 Oracz J and Nebesny E, Effect of roasting parameters on the physicochemical characteristics of high-molecular-weight Maillard reaction products isolated from cocoa beans of different *Theobroma cacao* L. groups. *Eur Food Res Technol* **245**:111–128 (2019).
- 91 Tuenter E, Foubert K and Pieters L, Mood components in cocoa and chocolate: the mood pyramid. *Planta Med* **84**:839–844 (2018).
- 92 Barrera-Reyes PK, de Lara JC-F, González-Soto M and Tejero ME, Effects of cocoa-derived polyphenols on cognitive function in humans. Systematic review and analysis of methodological aspects. *Plant Foods Hum Nutr* **75**:1–11 (2020).
- 93 Ooi TS, Ting ASY and Siow LF, Influence of selected native yeast starter cultures on the antioxidant activities, fermentation index and total soluble solids of Malaysia cocoa beans: a simulation study. *LWT Food Sci Technol* **122**:108977 (2020).
- 94 Vanderschueren R, De Mesmaeker V, Mounicou S, Isaure M-P, Doelsch E, Montalvo D *et al.*, The impact of fermentation on the distribution of cadmium in cacao beans. *Food Res Int* **127**:108743 (2020).
- 95 Lewis C, Lennon AM, Eudoxie G and Umaharan P, Genetic variation in bioaccumulation and partitioning of cadmium in *Theobroma cacao* L. *Sci Total Environ* **640–641**:696–703 (2018).
- 96 Maddela NR, Kakarla D, García LC, Chakraborty S, Venkateswarlu K and Megharaj M, Cocoa-laden cadmium threatens human health and cacao economy: a critical view. *Sci Total Environ* **720**:137645 (2020).
- 97 Lindo AA, Robinson DE, Tennant PF, Meinhardt LW and Zhang D, Molecular characterization of cacao (*Theobroma cacao*) germplasm from Jamaica using single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) markers. *Trop Plant Biol* **11**:93–106 (2018).
- 98 Everaert H, De Wever J, TKH T, TLA V, Maebe K, Rottiers H *et al.*, Genetic classification of Vietnamese cacao cultivars assessed by SNP and SSR markers. *Tree Genet Genomes* **16**:43 (2020).
- 99 Ramírez-Guillermo MÁ, Lagunes-Espinoza LC, Ortiz-García CF and Gutiérrez OA, Morphological variation of cacao (*Theobroma cacao* L.) fruits and seeds from plantations in Tabasco, Mexico. *Rev Fitotec Mex* 41:117–125 (2018).
- 100 Acierno V, Fasciani G, Kiani S, Caligiani A and van Ruth S, PTR-QiToF-MS and HSI for the characterization of fermented cocoa beans from different origins. *Food Chem* **289**:591–602 (2019).
- 101 Acierno V, Alewijn M, Zomer P and van Ruth SM, Making cocoa origin traceable: fingerprints of chocolates using flow infusion–electro spray ionization–mass spectrometry. *Food Control* **85**:245–252 (2018).
- 102 Acierno V, de Jonge L and van Ruth S, Sniffing out cocoa bean traits that persist in chocolates by PTR-MS, ICP-MS and IR-MS. *Food Res Int* **133**:109212 (2020).
- 103 Acierno V, Liu N, Alewijn M, Stieger M and van Ruth SM, Which cocoa bean traits persist when eating chocolate? Real-time nosespace analysis by PTR-QiToF-MS. *Talanta* **195**:676–682 (2019).
- 104 Mustiga GM, Morrissey J, Stack JC, DuVal A, Royaert S, Jansen J *et al.*, Identification of climate and genetic factors that control fat content and fatty acid composition of *Theobroma cacao* L. beans. *Front Plant Sci* **10**:1159 (2019).
- 105 Scollo E, Neville DCA, Oruna-Concha MJJ, Trotin M, Umaharan P, Sukha D *et al.*, Proteomic and peptidomic UHPLC-ESI MS/MS analysis of cocoa beans fermented using the Styrofoam-box method. *Food Chem* **316**:126350 (2020).
- 106 Febrianto NA and Zhu F, Diversity in composition of bioactive compounds among 26 cocoa genotypes. J Agric Food Chem 67: 9501–9509 (2019).
- 107 Cruz JFM, Leite PB, Soares SE and Bispo E d S, Bioactive compounds in different cocoa (*Theobroma cacao*, L) cultivars during fermentation. *Food Sci Technol* **35**:279–284 (2015).

108 Salama AK, Health risk assessment of heavy metals content in cocoa and chocolate products sold in Saudi Arabia. *Toxin Rev* 38:318–327 (2019).

109 Mohamed R, Zainudin BH and Yaakob AS, Method validation and determination of heavy metals in cocoa beans and cocoa products by microwave assisted digestion technique with inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry. *Food Chem* **303**:125392 (2020).

110 Kataoka Y, Watanabe T, Hayashi K and Akiyama H, Surveillance of cadmium concentration in chocolate and cocoa powder products distributed in Japan. *Food Hyg Saf Sci* **59**:269–274 (2018).

- 111 Rodríguez Albarrcín HS, Darghan Contreras AE and Henao MC, Spatial regression modeling of soils with high cadmium content in a cocoa producing area of Central Colombia. *Geoderma Rea* 16:e00214 (2019).
- 112 Maciel LF, de Felício ALSM, Miranda LCR, Pires TC, Bispo E da S and Hirooka EY, Aflatoxins and ochratoxin a in different cocoa clones (*Theobroma cacao* L.) developed in the southern region of Bahia, Brazil. Food Addit Contam A **35**:134–143 (2018).
- 113 Pires PN, Vargas EA, Gomes MB, Vieira CBM, Santos EAD, Bicalho AAC et al., Aflatoxins and ochratoxin a: occurrence and contamination levels in cocoa beans from Brazil. *Food Addit Contam A* **36**:815–824 (2019).
- 114 Teye E, Anyidoho E, Agbemafle R, Sam-Amoah LK and Elliott C, Cocoa bean and cocoa bean products quality evaluation by NIR spectroscopy and chemometrics: a review. *Infrared Phys Technol* **104**: 103127 (2020).

- 115 Hashimoto JC, Lima JC, Celeghini RMS, Nogueira AB, Efraim P, Poppi RJ *et al.*, Quality control of commercial cocoa beans (*Theo-broma cacao* L.) by near-infrared spectroscopy. *Food Anal Methods* **11**:1510–1517 (2018).
- 116 Mandrile L, Barbosa-Pereira L, Sorensen KM, Giovannozzi AM, Zeppa G, Engelsen SB *et al.*, Authentication of cocoa bean shells by near- and mid-infrared spectroscopy and inductively coupled plasma-optical emission spectroscopy. *Food Chem* **292**:47–57 (2019).
- 117 Anyidoho EK, Teye E and Agbemafle R, Nondestructive authentication of the regional and geographical origin of cocoa beans by using a handheld NIR spectrometer and multivariate algorithm. *Anal Methods* **12**:4150–4158 (2020).
- 118 Cruz-Tirado JP, Fernández Pierna JA, Rogez H, Barbin DF and Baeten V, Authentication of cocoa (*Theobroma cacao*) bean hybrids by NIR-hyperspectral imaging and chemometrics. *Food Control* **118**: 107445 (2020).
- 119 Utrilla-Vázquez M, Rodríguez-Campos J, Avendaño-Arazate CH, Gschaedler A and Lugo-Cervantes E, Analysis of volatile compounds of five varieties of Maya cocoa during fermentation and drying processes by Venn diagram and PCA. *Food Res Int* **129**:108834 (2020).
- 120 Medina S, Perestrelo R, Silva P, Pereira JAM and Câmara JS, Current trends and recent advances on food authenticity technologies and chemometric approaches. *Trends Food Sci Technol* **85**:163–176 (2019).